



Instructions for Reviewers

This document provides instructions for submitting review comments on the California Nitrogen Assessment (CNA) and should be used in conjunction with the MS Excel document, “*Template for Reviewer Comments*”. Supporting materials are also provided (project summary, draft table of contents for the full report, and a list of the review editors). We urge all reviewers to read these materials before undertaking your review as they will provide an overview of the goals and scope of the project. Further details on the assessment are available on the Agricultural Sustainability Institute’s website at www.nitrogen.ucdavis.edu.

We are modeling this review process after those used by the [Millennium Ecosystem Assessment](#) (MA) and the [Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change](#) (IPCC). This guide, as well as the template for submitting comments, has been adapted from those used by reviewers of the MA.

Please note that this is not a blind review; reviewers and their associated comments will be made public to maintain transparency in the process and promote credibility in the findings. The names and contributions of all reviewers will be acknowledged in the final assessment report.

Instructions for accessing draft chapters for review:

PDF files for individual chapters can be downloaded at:

<http://www.nitrogen.ucdavis.edu/research/nitrogen/review-process-1>

Go to Scientific Review page:

login: cnascireview

password: N1tr0gen

The Project Team has identified a specific chapter and, in some cases, specific sections in your area of expertise that we hope you will review. But, you are welcome to read and/or submit review comments on any of the chapters of the assessment report. The “Supplemental Data Tables” should be reviewed in parallel as they are meant to support the findings in the chapters.

Please note that the report is currently still in development and draft chapters (or sections) are undergoing review as they become available. We expect the scientific review of the full report to be complete by early 2014. The stakeholder review will commence in Fall 2013 and will be conducted on a chapter-by-chapter basis as they are revised following the scientific review process.



Instructions for recording review comments:

(1) Reviewer Contact Information:

- Please provide the full contact information of the individual submitting review comments. We will acknowledge reviewers in the final publication using their name and institution. ***Please use the MS Excel template provided, “CNA_Template for Reviewer Comments”, and enter this information on the “Reviewer Contact Information” worksheet.***

(2) Reviewer Comments:

- To ensure your comments are given appropriate consideration by authors, ***please follow the instructions below and use the MS Excel template provided, “CNA_Template for Reviewer Comments” and record your comments in the “Reviewer Comments” worksheet.***
- Please do not cite or quote the draft report other than in your review, nor represent any material in the draft report as reflecting the preliminary findings of the California Nitrogen Assessment.
- ***Please consider the following when providing your review comments:***
 - Does the chapter provide a balanced presentation of the available scientific evidence?
 - Does the chapter present the most salient scientific work to date on this topic? Is anything critical to the understanding of this topic missing? Please provide details and/or suggestions on appropriate changes.
 - Are the interpretations of the scientific literature on this topic and the chapter’s draft conclusions valid?
 - Are there citations for important sources of information that have not been referenced? Please provide details.
 - Does the chapter clearly indicate the degree of certainty/uncertainty of findings?
 - Does the chapter clearly present the essential scientific principles for an informed lay audience?
 - Are there other shortcomings to the chapter – e.g., inconsistencies within the chapter and/or across other chapters, non-essential material that could be deleted? Please provide details of why a change should be made and, if appropriate, provide suggestions on suitable modifications.
- **General or overview comments** on the entire chapter should be recorded first and be specified using Section 0/Page 0/Line 0. Note that you may also enter general comments for the full report by specifying Chapter 0.



Example:

Surname	Given name	Organization	Chapter	Section	Page	Line	Comments
Smith	John	UC Davis	0	0	0	0	Comment....(this is an example of a comment on the full report/project)
			4	0	0	0	Comment.....(this is an example of a general comment for all of chapter 4)

- **Specific comments** on the material in the chapter should follow the general comments and must be labeled by section, page number and line number.
- Comments that refer to a table or figure should identify the page number and the table or figure number. In the case of tables, please also identify the row and column to which the comment refers.

Example:

Surname	Given name	Organization	Chapter	Section	Page	Line	Comments
Smith	John	UC Davis	4	4.1.2	5	20	Comment....(this is an example of a specific comment)
			4		10	55	Table 4.1, Row 1, Column 1 Comment(this is an example of an entry for a table)
			4		15	110	Figure 4.1 Comment....(this is an example of an entry for a figure)

- When entering your comments in the template, please note:
 - You need only enter your name and organization on the first entry.
 - When entering long comments, you can double-click on the text in the cell to make edits.
- Please refrain from commenting on grammar, spelling, or punctuation, unless it affects the meaning or clarity of the presentation. Professional copyediting will correct deficiencies in these areas for the final draft.

Instructions for submitting review comments:

Once you have concluded your review, please send your completed contact information and comments to:

SUBJECT: California Nitrogen Assessment – Scientific Review Comments
 Email: nitrogen@ucdavis.edu